



This project is co-financed by the
European Union and the Republic of Turkey

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE FOR PROMOTING DECENT FUTURE OF WORK APPROACH WITH A FOCUS ON GENDER EQUALITY

(TREESP1.3. FoW/P-01)

TURKEY

QUALITATIVE DESK RESEARCH SECTORAL REPORT



Geliş



This project is co-financed by the
European Union and the Republic of Turkey

**TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE FOR PROMOTING DECENT FUTURE OF
WORK APPROACH WITH A FOCUS ON GENDER EQUALITY**

(EuropeAid/140341/IH/SER/TR)

TURKEY

QUALITATIVE DESK RESEARCH - SECTORAL REPORT



This project is co-financed by the European Union and the Republic of Turkey



This project is co-financed by the European Union and the Republic of Turkey

Table of Contents

<u>LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS</u>	5
<u>1. INTRODUCTION</u>	6
<u>2. METHODOLOGY</u>	7
<u>3. SECTORAL STUDIES</u>	8
<u>A. Scope for New Employment</u>	8
<u>B. Education Implications</u>	8
<u>C. Current Issues to be Addressed</u>	9
<u>D. Policy Changes Needed</u>	9
<u>4. EMPLOYMENT FOR PWDS</u>	11
<u>A. Scope for New Employment</u>	11
<u>B. Education Implications</u>	11
<u>C. Current Issues to be Addressed</u>	11
<u>D. Policy Changes Needed</u>	12
<u>5. MOBBING</u>	13
<u>A. Scope for New Employment</u>	13
<u>B. Current Issues to be Addressed</u>	13
<u>C. Policy Changes Needed</u>	13
<u>6. IMPACT ASSESSMENT</u>	14
<u>A. Scope for New Employment</u>	14
<u>B. Current Issues to be Addressed</u>	14
<u>C. Policy Changes Needed</u>	14
<u>7. PRELIMINARY CONCLUSIONS</u>	15
<u>8. BIBLIOGRAPHY</u>	16
<u>9. LIST OF ANNEXES</u>	17



This project is co-financed by the European Union and the Republic of Turkey



This project is co-financed by the
European Union and the Republic of Turkey

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Meaning
DİSK	Confederation Progressive Trade Unions of Turkey
HAK-İŞ	Trade Union Confederation
İŞKUR	Turkish Employment Agency
MoFLSS	Ministry of Family, Labour and Social Services (March 2021)
PWDs	Persons with Disabilities
TİSK	Turkish Confederation of Employer Associations
TÜRK-İŞ	Confederation of Turkish Trade Unions
TUIK	Turkish Statistical Institute (TURKSTAT)



This project is co-financed by the
European Union and the Republic of Turkey

1. INTRODUCTION

Employment promotion in different sectors requires a comprehensive approach, and include issues related to economy, as the relation of the sector with the GDP, the quantity and quality of workers, the demand for workers by the private sector and the matching of skills supplied and demanded.

8, TAT conducted 21 interviews involving 27 representatives for all research activities from the following organisations:

- DİSK - Confederation Progressive Trade Unions of Turkey
- HAK-İŞ - Trade Union Confederation
- İŞKUR - Turkish Employment Agency
- Ministry of Industry and Technology
- MoLSS - Social Security Institutions
- MoFSS-General Directorate of the Status of Women
- The Ombudsman Institution
- TİSK-Turkish Confederation of Employer Associations
- TÜRK-İŞ - Confederation of Turkish Trade Unions

This Report is presented in bullet-point format as this may the most effective way of exposing the key points raised by each interviewee. The Conclusions section then summarised the stand-out issues which emerged from the process, which will be used by TAT to guide the focus for the questionnaires to be developed for the field work and workshops processes.



This project is co-financed by the European Union and the Republic of Turkey

2. METHODOLOGY

The aim of the interviews was not to provide an exhaustive stakeholder analysis. Rather, it was to receive a number of views of what those stakeholders considered to be of interest and priority within their respective ranges of vested interest. TAT focussed not only on Intervention 8 (Sector Studies) but broadened out to embrace the all of the study areas required within Category 3. A more comprehensive assessment of stakeholder opinion will be made during the pre-/post-study workshops anticipated under Intervention 12 – but the contributions of stakeholders, captured in this Report, provide a number of signposts which will help TAT and its NKEs to focus this subsequent work more effectively.

Depending on the Institution and the area of expertise of the interviewee, a questionnaire of three (or four) questions were sent. In many cases we sent another set of questions after the interview.

Some of the general questions were¹: Which according to your experience are the sectors more important for the employment of the future of work in Turkey? Which are the possibilities to increase the women employment in these sectors? And for PWDs? Which are the skills needed for the future labour demand in Turkey in these sectors? Do you think the technological centres are prepared to train people in these areas?

A list of possible interviewees was provided by the OCU. They have contacted them first with a letter explaining the aims of our goal. After that, a person of our team sends them an email with information of the Program and the questions translated from English to Turkish. Some of them send the answers before the interview, and they were translated to English. They received a zoom link and all the interviews (with interpretation from Turkish to English) have been recorded.

After each interview, a brief report was drafted divided into the 4, in line with the 4 studies set out under Category 3:

- Sectoral Studies
- Employment for PWDs
- Mobbing
- Impact Assessment

In almost all the cases, TAT attempted to group responses into the following categories:

- Scope for New Employment
- Education Implications
- Current Issues to be addressed
- Policy Changes Needed.

The following sections provide bullet-point summaries of the interviews.



This project is co-financed by the European Union and the Republic of Turkey

3. SECTORAL STUDIES

A. Scope for New Employment

The IT sector was generally seen as very important although some divergences of view were observed among interviewees.

Mr. Hüseyin Cesurhan Taş, Ministry of Industry and Technology:

- Choice of sectors is influenced by which region is targeted – e.g. Ankara for aerospace, Konya for defence; digital transformation cross-cuts all sectors and regions.

Mrs. Gözde ÖDEMiŞ- İŞKUR - Turkish Employment Agency:

- Technology literacy increasingly important,
- New jobs will require high-level cognitive, social, emotional, and technological skills,
- ICT jobs: Future professions: e-Commerce Specialist; CNC Operator; Gerontologist; Internet of Things (IOT) Expert; Blockchain Expert; Green Energy Engineer; Drone Operator; Automation Engineer; Information Security Specialist; Respiratory Therapist; Emotional Behavioural Sciences Specialist.

Mr. Sudi Aydemir – General Manager – President of Sector Council of Capital Market

- Digitalisation transformations accelerated due to pandemic,
- Greater emphasis on mobile flexible communications,
- Future professions: Business/Data Analyst; Robotisation Expert,
- Need for more universities + technology centres to lead the change,
- For women: more emphasis on training in European approach and behaviours to capital markets + digitalisation.

Mrs. Melike ÖZTÜRK and Mrs. Nagehan AKAN, Representatives of TISK

- Gender perspective,
- Movement away from production, service, retail/sales, education towards technology-based professions (which can include textiles).

Güldane KARSLIOĞLU YENİ - TÜRK-İŞ - Confederation of Turkish Trade Unions

- Gender perspective,
- Focus on digital/computing technologies (software, programming, robotics AI).

B. Education Implications

General consensus on the need for greater emphasis on a gender perspective including:

- Greater emphasis (and willingness to participate in) on technology training,
- Technology Centres can/should lead on this change,
- R7D, design centres and techno parks need to be increased.



This project is co-financed by the European Union and the Republic of Turkey

Mrs. Melike ÖZTÜRK and Mrs. Nagehan AKAN, Representatives of TISK,

- Research suggests 8m existing jobs will disappear and 9m new jobs will be created by 2030,
- In textiles, focus will be on electronics/automation/nano-fibre production – 31 new competency areas identified,
- On-the-job upskilling needed – maintaining current work while learning new skills,
- Training required in ‘soft skills’ – new generation leadership; HR; design-oriented thinking; + ‘hard’ skills – software development and informatics.

Mr. Hüseyin Cesurhan Taş, Ministry of Industry and Technology:

- Even greater emphasis on adjusting technology centre courses to fit with industry needs for skills,
- Only 10% of technology centre courses attended by women,
- Men predominate in factories with women mainly in roles in industry associations.

Mrs. Melike ÖZTÜRK and Mrs. Nagehan AKAN, Representatives of TISK

- 5 key training programmes of benefit to young people: Automation Supported Quality Control, Robot Operator, Computer Aided New Generation Design, Product Development Expertise and Future Professions Focused Social and Cognitive Competencies.

C. Current Issues to be Addressed

Mrs. Fatma Zengin – HAK - IS

- (Interview focussed mainly on a gender perspective):
- Women suffer from: difficulties balancing work and domestic life; inadequate care services; lack of decision-making representation, employer preference for male employees; ,
- Women tend to opt for lower status, often informal jobs (e.g. cleaning) as the only perceived solution.

Mrs. Cennet Can – HAK- IS

- (Again, the interview focussed on gender):
- Women do struggle to balance work and domestic responsibilities,
- More tendency to opt for informal, irregular work,
- In work, they face gender discrimination and sexual harassment.
- Women are frequently excluded from decision-making at work and from training opportunities.

D. Policy Changes Needed

- (General consensus) Need for more women in employment,
- Need for women’s workplace equality needs to be advocated,
- Technology can open up opportunities for more home-based work which could address some of the work/domestic responsibilities balance.
- Gender pay gap results partly from women having interrupted work life (to produce families),
- Need for gender-focused policies on maternal leave/leave to attend illness in families,



This project is co-financed by the
European Union and the Republic of Turkey

- Lower earnings = lower pensions,
- Social security keeps families afloat.

Mr. Özdem AKÇAM - Social Security Expert

- Changing demographics require changes in risk-management approach of social security service (e.g. people living longer),
- Places financial (hence sustainability) burden on social security budgets.



This project is co-financed by the European Union and the Republic of Turkey

4. EMPLOYMENT FOR PWDS

A. Scope for New Employment

- Many businesses struggle to address the physical requirements of a PwD employee,
- Greater emphasis needed on applying quota system for protecting PwD-related jobs and combatting discrimination through legislation,
- Need to reassess the types of future work suitable for PwDs.

B. Education Implications

Ms. Fatma Koçulu. General Directorate of Services for Persons with Disabilities and the Elderly- MoFSS.

- Quota system = companies employing 50+ must employ 3% PwDs,
- Monthly fines for failure to comply – but many businesses opt to pay fines + engage PwDs only for a 3-month contract,
- Alternative system needed, including additional incentives to engage PwDs,
- Plus employer education needed,
- Vocational training system needs to embrace possibilities of new forms of employment opened through digital transformation, and adapt to needs of PwDs.

Mrs. Elif Yıldırım – Committee on Disabled People – HAK- IS

- Disability is not a preference,
- NGOs can play a more important role in supporting PwDs,
- Vocational training can have very positive results for PwDs but needs to be even more effective and varied, based on longer-term policies,
- Improvements needed include: duration & quality of training; clearer competencies, preparatory training; training better matched to employer needs; distance learning (including e-learning) options,
- Job skills (including entrepreneurship) training should be included in the vocational training curricula.

Mrs. Gözde ÖDEMiŞ - İSKUR- Employment Assistant Specialist

- İŞKUR supports / provides the services of vocational training; on-the-job training, Community Benefit Programmes (TYP), Entrepreneurship Training; Social Benefit Programs, Disabled and Former Convicts Programmes + Self-Employment Support.

c. Current Issues to be Addressed

Mrs. Elif Yıldırım – Committee on Disabled People – HAK- IS

- 98% of registered Turkish companies are micro employing less than 50 people and are therefore outside the scope,
- Quota system could be expanded to cover smaller companies,



This project is co-financed by the
European Union and the Republic of Turkey

- Need to address employer perceptions of disadvantages of employing PwDs (productivity rates, lower levels of education; cost of workplace adaptation).

D. Policy Changes Needed

Mrs. Elif Yıldırım – Committee on Disabled People – HAK- IS

- Being a disabled woman is a double disadvantage,
- Numerous policy changes could help:
 - Support to PwD self-support groups,
 - Greater access to support services,
 - Equal opportunities,
 - Advocation of greater women/girl (disabled) access to education,
 - Advocation of greater involvement in social, cultural, artistic activities,
 - Greater involvement in decision-making,
 - More care/accommodation services for victims of abuse.



This project is co-financed by the European Union and the Republic of Turkey

5. MOBBING

A. Scope for New Employment

- Need for improvement of image/dignity of working women,
- Need to eliminate violence and harassment.

Mrs. Cennet Can, HAK- IS

- Stronger legislation needed to eliminate violence towards women in the workplace.

B. Current Issues to be Addressed

- Mobbing, violence and harassment attack personal dignity and generate insecurity and absenteeism,
- Coordinated gender-focused policies needed to address the problem while, at the same time, recognising it as a problem.

C. Policy Changes Needed

Mrs. Didem YETER GÜLER, Ombudsman Specialist

- System of receiving/recording violence complaints maintained by Ombudsman.

Mrs. Fulya Pınar ÖZCAN, HAK- IS

- Textile sector has a particularly high incidence of mobbing and harassment.



This project is co-financed by the
European Union and the Republic of Turkey

6. IMPACT ASSESSMENT

A. Scope for New Employment

- General consensus is improved maternity/paternity legislation needed,
- Need to increase childcare facilities (ref. to ISKUR 2 projects – Childcare Support + Here’s Mom both started in 2018).

B. Current Issues to be Addressed

- Unpaid care work by women is the greatest hinderance to increasing women’s employment and involvement in public life (i.e. keeping them at home),
- Advocacy needed to help address imbalance of domestic duties among men and women.

C. Policy Changes Needed

Mrs. Cennet Can – HAK – IS

- Not everything has to be addressed by the State,
- Need to advocate greater balance of domestic responsibilities.

Mrs. Özgün Millioğulları (DİSK)

- Improved social dialogue structures needed to resolve economic and social issues,
- Greater collaboration between government, employers and unions needed to focus on women and care services.



This project is co-financed by the
European Union and the Republic of Turkey

7. PRELIMINARY CONCLUSIONS

As may be seen, this exercise was far from comprehensive, but interesting insights were provided. From all the responses, the following stand-out issues appeared to have some consensus among interviewees:

- Digital transformation will change the way we work and is real and upon us,
- New and rewarding jobs can be created but new skills need to be developed to seize these opportunities,
- Technology Centres + Techno Parks should play a greater role in re/upskilling and be expanded,
- Women need to be encouraged to see themselves in new roles and to take advantage of training programmes (only 10% of trainee places in Technology Centres occupied by women),
- Greater emphasis needs to be placed on the provision of caring services (elderly and children) if more women are to be able to work,
- Better maternity/paternity leave provisions needed,
- Mobbing and harassment need to be tackled strongly with policies and legislation to create an enabling environment for women's decent future of work,
- Advocacy needed to encourage greater male involvement in domestic responsibilities and to release women into the workforce,
- PwD quota system seems ineffective, and alternatives need to be introduced,
- Employers reluctant to invest in localised infrastructure changes to accommodate PwDs,
- Disabled women suffer a double disadvantage in job seeking,
- Improved social dialogue structures (public/private/third sectors) needed to address socio-economic issues, included greater collaboration between Ministries.

TAT intends to pursue these issues in greater depth during the field work and stakeholder workshops anticipated within category 3 and Intervention 12.

FoW TAT

May 2021



This project is co-financed by the
European Union and the Republic of Turkey

8. BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ), 'Guidelines for an Employment and Labour Market Analysis (ELMA)', (2016).
- EC (European Commission), 2006. 'Promoting Decent Work for All: The EU Contribution to the Implementation of the Decent Work Agenda in the World'. Communication, COM (2006)
- EC, Brussels. EC (European Commission), 2018. 'Promoting Employment and Decent Work in Development Cooperation. Volume 1: Concepts and Foundations'. Tools and Methods Series, Concept Paper No. 6. EC, Brussels.
- EC, Brussels. EC (European Commission), 2021. 'Promoting Employment and Decent Work in Development Cooperation. Volume 2: Practical guidance for designing employment-focused interventions. Tools and Methods Series, Concept Paper No. 6. EC, Brussels.
- ILO (International Labour Organization) (2020) 'Rapid Diagnostics for Assessing the Country Level Impact of COVID-19 on the Economy and Labour Market: Guidelines'
- ILO (International Labour Organization) (2019) Centenary Declaration for the Future of Work
- ILO (International Labour Organization) (2018). Back to the future: Challenges and opportunities for the future of work addressed in ILO sectoral meetings since 2010.
- ILO (International Labour Organization) (2015) 'Decent Work Country Diagnostics: Technical Guidelines to Draft the Diagnostic Report'.
- ILO (International Labour Organization) (2013) Assessing Progress on Decent Work at the National Level: Guidelines.
- ILO (International Labour Organization), (2012) 'Employment Diagnostic Analysis: A Methodological Guide'
- ILO (International Labour Organization), 2008. 'ILO Declaration on Social Justice for a Fair Globalization'. ILO, Geneva.
- Pastore, F., Gaušas, S., & Styczyńska, I. (2019). *EU and ILO: Shaping the Future of Work*. European Parliament.
- Silva, V. (2021). The ILO and the future of work: The politics of global labour policy. *Global Social Policy*, 14680181211004853.
- World Bank, (2019) 'Annex 1: Guided Enquiry for Jobs Diagnostics' (n.d.). World Bank, Jobs Diagnostics (website). World Bank, 'Jobs Diagnostics Guidelines'



This project is co-financed by the
European Union and the Republic of Turkey

9. LIST OF ANNEXES

Annex I. List of Persons interviewed

- MoFSS- General Directorate of Disabled and Elderly Services - Fatma KOÇULU
- DİSK -Özgün Millioğulları
- HAK-İŞ - Cennet CAN
- HAK-İŞ - Fatma ZENGİN
- HAK-İŞ - Elif YILDIRIM
- HAK-İŞ -Fulya Pınar ÖZCAN
- İŞKUR - Aslı ÇOBAN
- İŞKUR - Gözde ÖDEMİŞ
- İŞKUR - Merve KARAKUŞ
- İŞKUR -Mesut ÇEBİ
- İŞKUR -Abdullah Tamer YILMAZ
- Ministry of Industry and Technology - Hüseyin Cesurhan TAŞ
- MoFSS -General Directorate on the Status of Women- Akın YUMUŞ
- SGK -Özgen AKÇAM
- The Ombudsman Institution-Didem YETER GÜLER
- The Union of Chambers and Commodity Exchanges of Turkey -Murat Aydın and Sudi Aydemir
- TİSK - Melike ÖZTÜRK and Nagehan AKAN
- TÜRK-İŞ - - Güldane KARSLIOĞLU YENİ





This publication was produced with the financial support of the European Union and the Republic of Turkey. Its contents are the sole responsibility of the consortium led by WEglobal A.Ş. in consortium with WEglobal Italy, Archidata Srl, and Federation of Trentina Cooperatives (FTC) and do not necessarily reflect the views of the European Union and the Republic of Turkey.



This project is co-financed by the European Union and the Republic of Turkey
