



This project is co-financed by the
European Union and the Republic of Turkey

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE FOR PROMOTING DECENT FUTURE OF WORK APPROACH WITH A FOCUS ON GENDER EQUALITY

(TREESP1.3. FoW/P-01)

TURKEY

INTERVENTION 13: WORKSHOPS FOR NEW EMPLOYMENT STRATEGIES

REPORT ON ADANA-BASED WORKSHOP HELD ON 12 JANUARY 2022





This project is co-financed by the
European Union and the Republic of Turkey

**TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE FOR PROMOTING DECENT FUTURE OF
WORK APPROACH WITH A FOCUS ON GENDER EQUALITY**

(EuropeAid/140341/IH/SER/TR)

TURKEY

**INTERVENTION 13: WORKSHOPS FOR NEW EMPLOYMENT STRATEGIES
REPORT ON THE ADANA-BASED WORKSHOP HELD ON 12 JANUARY 2022**



This project is co-financed by the European Union and the Republic of Turkey

Table of Contents

1. INTRODUCTION	5
2. CONTEXT	5
2.1 Project ToR	5
2.2 MOLSS Focus	5
3. DESCRIPTION OF THE EVENT	5
3.1 Venue	5
3.2 Agenda	5
3.3 Participants	6
3.4 Visibility	6
4. WORKSHOP CONTENT	6
4.1. INTRODUCTION TO THE NATIONAL STRATEGY AND THE PROJECT ‘PROMOTING DECENT FUTURE OF WORK WITH A FOCUS ON GENDER PERSPECTIVE’	6
4.2. EVALUATION OF THE CURRENT SITUATION OF THE LABOUR MARKET AND DETECTION OF PROBLEMS IN ADANA PROVINCE	7
4.2.1 Employment per Sector in Adana:	7
4.2.2. Education Related to Employment:	8
4.2.3. Women’s Employment	9
4.2.4. Regulations Needed	10
4.3. DEVELOPING POLICY SUGGESTIONS FOR THE SOLUTION OF PROBLEMS IN THE LABOUR MARKET IN ADANA PROVINCE	10
4.3.1. Employment per Sectors in Adana	10
4.3.2. Education Related to Employment	11
4.3.3. Women’s Employment:	11
5. DESCRIPTION OF PROCESS	12
6. CONCLUSION	12



This project is co-financed by the European Union and the Republic of Turkey

1. INTRODUCTION

This Report provides a summary of the Adana-based Workshop, held on 12 January 2022, under Intervention 13 (Workshops for New Employment Strategies).

2. CONTEXT

2.1 Project ToR

The Project's Terms of Reference (ToR) for Intervention 13 require the following:

Five workshops will be organised in the pilot provinces to have feedbacks and inputs for drafting new employment strategies such as NES, women employment policies and to discuss regional needs and problems with the participation of relevant public institutions, academicians, NGOs, social partners, professional organisations, representatives of private sector. Indicative list of pilot provinces: Adana, Bursa, İstanbul and İzmir. Fifty local participants will deal with each workshop and will last one day. After completion of the workshops, a detailed report will be prepared by the Contractor. Five staff of the Operation Beneficiary will participate to each workshop.

2.2 MOLSS Focus

The Operation Beneficiary (OB) requested that the Adana-based Workshop should focus on an analysis of labour market issues and problems currently being experienced in Adana province, linked to discussions of possible policy solutions.

3. DESCRIPTION OF THE EVENT

3.1 Venue

It was decided that the Workshop should be held as a physical event, allowable because of an easing of pandemic-related restrictions. The OB selected the Adana Sheraton Hotel as it offered the space and facilities which were required for the event. The cost of arranging the event was an eligible item in the Project's Incidental Budget: the overall cost of the event was just over 6.325 EUR, including per diems.

3.2 Agenda

TAT and OB worked together on the agenda for the Workshop, the final version was as follows:

Time	Agenda
09.30 - 10.00	Registration
10.00 - 10.15	Opening Speech Mr. Nurcan Önder General Director of General Directorate of Labour



This project is co-financed by the European Union and the Republic of Turkey

	<i>T.R. The Ministry of Labour and Social Security</i>
10.15 - 11.15	Evaluation of the Current Situation of the Labour Market in Adana Province and Detection of Problems
11.15 - 11.30	Break
11.30 - 12.30	Evaluation of the Current Situation of the Labour Market in Adana Province and Identification of the Problems (Continued)
12.30 - 13.30	Lunch Break
13.30 - 14.45	Developing Policy Suggestions for the Solution of Problems in the Labour Market in Adana Province
14.45 - 15.00	Break
15.00 – 16.30	Development of Policy Suggestions Regarding the Solution of Problems in the Labour Market in Adana Province (Continued)
16.30 – 17.00	Evaluation and Closing

3.3 Participants

TAT drafted an e-invitation to the event which was distributed by OB. 71 participants joined the workshop, representing different organisations and institutions, of which 30 were public sector, 6 were private sector and 26 were other institutions/organisations. 5 MoLSS staff were present and 4 persons from TAT. A participant list is attached at Annex 1.

3.4 Visibility

The Project's visibility materials were displayed:

- A 'spider' was used as a backdrop for the registration table.
- 2 sets of banners (Turkish flag; HRDOS logo; MoLSS logo) were hung in the meeting area;
- Visibility kits were issued to all participants comprising: bag; notepad; pen; factsheet; folder; USB stick; mug.

4. WORKSHOP CONTENT

4.1. INTRODUCTION TO THE NATIONAL STRATEGY AND THE PROJECT 'PROMOTING DECENT FUTURE OF WORK WITH A FOCUS ON GENDER PERSPECTIVE'

The representatives of the MoLSS noted that Adana province has a great potential in labour market and that it was very important to receive the opinions of Adana labour market stakeholders (potential solutions to the diagnosed problems, ideas on laws, etc.).

They stated that the world stands on the brink of a technological revolution that will fundamentally alter the way we live, work, and relate to one another. In its scale, a transformation is needed. The response to it must be integrated and comprehensive, involving all stakeholders, from the public and



This project is co-financed by the European Union and the Republic of Turkey

private sectors to academia and civil society. The MoLSS considers this transformation in employment very seriously.

The pandemic has undoubtedly triggered lasting changes when it comes to work. Many were part of a forced experience in remote working, others found themselves in jobs that required them to personally confront the virus on a daily basis just to keep society running. But all the workers feel the pandemic has forced them to rethink the balance between their work and their personal lives.

Also, the current reports says that 60% of today's jobs would no longer exist in the next 10 years by automation, and 9 out of 10 jobs will require digital skills. Two scenarios could be mentioned: The first scenario foresees that the machinery and robotics would take place of humans. In the second scenario, rather than being replaced by computers, most workers will instead work alongside rapidly evolving machines. The future of work will see a shift in demand away from office support positions, machine operators, and other low-skill professions - and towards technology professionals such as computer engineers and information communication technology (ICT) specialists.

For this second scenario, the main needs are a continuous change in education and a more qualified and efficient work. Two actions were required: first one was improvement on technology and the second was sustainable education. The legal mechanisms would be developed. Social dialogue would be maintained.

The main objective of this project was to be harmonised with digital transformation through providing gender equality, fair wages and social and health opportunities. The goal was to refer women and future together. And this would have a multiplier effect.

After a description of the components of the EU project 'Promoting decent Future of Work with a focus on gender perspective', the MoLSS representatives highlighted the importance of build capacities for setting better policies on decent work with a gender equality.

The presentation of the project included the importance of working with stakeholders and improving institutional capacity and awareness-raising of, inter alia, the fight against psychological harassment.

4.2. EVALUATION OF THE CURRENT SITUATION OF THE LABOUR MARKET AND DETECTION OF PROBLEMS IN ADANA PROVINCE

Some of the stakeholders presented their opinions, summarised as follows (*with, where relevant, the main contributor shown in italics in brackets*):

4.2.1 Employment per Sector in Adana:

- Adana is also on the eve of a digital and social transformation (*Secretary General of Adana Chamber of Industry*).
- Adana and Mersin provinces have a considerable potential in their farms but an employment problem: they were having difficulties in finding workers. There were cases when they hired people seeking for jobs, but there were people holding two university degrees and working as a butcher, and they leave the jobs very quickly. There is a need to find ways to ensure people do work according to their profiles. (*Chairman of Anatolian Lions Businessmen Association-ASKON*).
- Adana was having problems in terms of finding workers in agriculture. In the past, there was cotton and wheat and now everywhere is filled with citrus. However, no workers want to collect the citrus, and they relied on Syrian workers. If no measures and places to stay were



This project is co-financed by the European Union and the Republic of Turkey

made for the agricultural workers, Adana agriculture would collapse. (*Adana Chamber of Agriculture - CoA*).

- One of the main problems of the business world was informal economy because they couldn't be competitive. A discussion is needed to find the best solution on: Taxes, insurances, and the role of unions (*Türk-iş*).

4.2.2. Education Related to Employment:

- Cukurova University has the Adana Entrepreneurship Centre, focused on entrepreneurship, where they tried to keep 50 per cent in women and young entrepreneurs. They have courses on defence industry, digitalisation and health technologies. However, the young population do not want to stay in Adana but go to İstanbul. They are planning to visit the middle school and select talented kids who will be trained in the areas of digitalisation, and social media to retain these talents in the province. (*Cukurova University Representative*).
- Education policies need to be improved in the upcoming period, according to the needs of the business world. There are at least three problems:
 - The education provided in technical schools do not meet the qualifications required by the world of work. A more focused training was needed to meet industry's requirements. The problems were not directly related to the curriculum, but with the teachers that not renovate their techniques of teaching.
 - The problem with white-collar jobs was that the students don't graduate with necessary qualifications. That is why it was significant to define and support the needs and required qualifications.
 - Graduates of technical schools do not find satisfaction in the labour market because they receive only minimum wage (*Secretary General of Adana Chamber of Industry*).
- The University is working with the Chambers to address the problems of lack of qualifications. İŞKUR is also extending its support. They started working with the departments of Engineering and Administrative Sciences, and they detected that the other problem is they have not enough academics who know new technologies and follow up the transitions that exist in industry. Lastly, the province needs to create jobs for the new graduates very quickly. We should be on the ground and prepare ourselves for the future. (*Nazmi Yalçın, Cukurova University Head of Business Department and Member of İŞKUR*).
- We have two topics: One of them is **occupational schools**: "We are receiving the demands for closing some courses at the occupational schools, like web design, motor, textile, which will carry us to the future of work. When we ask the reason for this demand, they said the students don't want it. But why? These selective courses should be advised by the teachers". And this is the second topic: **Teachers need to renovate their knowledge on the new skills need for the future of work**. (*Union of Chambers and Commodity Exchanges of Turkey (TOBB)*).
- More meetings are needed between Universities and to determine the needs of the world of work. These needs could be shared with the students. One of the important areas to cooperate is biotechnology. It is also important to support entrepreneurship, more courses, more grants for the entrepreneurs, that represent new sources of employment for others. (*Adana Alparslan Türkeş Üniversitesi*).
- KOSGEB representative noted that they gave 100.000 TL for new employment based and two-year non-refundable incentives. After two years, they start to pay in 6-month periods.



This project is co-financed by the European Union and the Republic of Turkey

The applications for this support end at the end of March 2022. The applicant should only promise hiring personnel. KOSGEB also extend support for the existing businesses to develop themselves (e.g., KOSGEB provides support to KOBİs - small and medium enterprises) (*KOSGEB representative*).

- It is important to consider best practices for occupational schools and to see the role of other actors as Foundations, Chambers, Commissions established between employers and employees to discuss about the occupations and jobs that the region needs. In occupational schools, there are successful programs but there is a need to find academics with a technical or technological background. (Educators who can offer value added education) (*Canakkale Commodity Exchange*).
 - The Food Sector started working on vocational proficiency trainings to be led by occupational schools. They need the Ministry's support to contribute to this process. (*Beyza Tavukculuk Human Resources Expert.*)

4.2.3. Women's Employment

- Women employment needs to be increased. There is a need to help women entrepreneurs and their projects. If the Ministry of Economy could reduce the tax rate from 22 to 15%, this would create an advantage in women employment. If a tax advantage was made for the businesses, this would automatically increase women's employment. (*Chairwoman of the Executive Board of Adana Businesswomen - İŞKAD*).
- On employment a gender-based perspective is needed, including protection of women's rights at work but also incentives for women's entrepreneurship. In Adana there are many women at home, taking care of their children (women's work is synonymous of domestic work). The region needs care centres, to create some opportunities with flexible work (e.g., in textile industry our association offers machines) – and to train women in digitalised future/skills. Other important problem are women in the process to be divorced, abandoned and without resources. They need financial support in order to protect their dignity, working in different sectors (*Kadash*).
- Pre-school incentives are needed and children should be raised jointly by men and women. New courses are needed even to help production at home. KADEM with the Public Education and Provincial Education Directorate have opened 98 courses for women (e-export and e-trade courses to be able to sell their products in the world of marketing and digitalisation). In the Food Sector, it is very important for women to enter into the hygiene and food sectors. Also, it is important to increase the number of women in agricultural development. Adana produces 40 per cent of fresh fruits and vegetables in food sector and agricultural cooperatives should be established for women to raise qualified work force. (*Project Coordinator of Women and Democracy Association -KADEM*).
- There are issues of domestic violence which affect women's life and their development at work. It is an urgent issue to be considered for all of us. (*Ceytech Makina*).
- "We are a call centre and with a workforce which comprises 66% of women. We provide home-based work both for women with children. Though we have cooperation with İŞKUR, there are problems in the areas of incentives. (The MoLSS General Director responded to this complaint by saying on-the-job training was not the only instrument to develop workforce market. On-the-job training was not very appropriate solution for the call centres, considering the centres gives a big contribution to the industry"). (*Mayen Telecommunication Human Resources*).



This project is co-financed by the European Union and the Republic of Turkey

- “We support home-based production but in order to place women in every segment of the management, then the State should have a moderator role model and facilitates a positive discrimination”. (*Union of Chambers and Commodity Exchanges of Turkey - TOBB*).
- The Ministry of Education need to have a central role to incorporate new capacities in the programs of Occupational Schools (*Turkish Union of Chambers of Commerce*).

4.2.4. Regulations Needed

- Employers offered minimum wage when there was no sufficient competence, but people leave their work after some months. A revision of the minimum wage is needed. (*Chamber of Industry - Col*).
- “The minimum wage needs to increase by 40 or 50%. The uncertainty in this issue has put us in a difficult position. We would like the statements to be made in gross rates. The employees told us that the state gave us 50% and you gave us a 40% raise. We couldn’t find interns. We couldn’t keep the workers. The most important reason is the informal economy. An unregistered torch man earns more than a registered one”. (*Ceytech Makina*).
- There should be a legal regulation to avoid people quitting their jobs soon after taking them up. (*Chairman of Anatolian Lions Businessman Association - ASKON*).
- In agriculture, Social Security must be ensured for the young generation. Minimum wage must be increased and a regulation for the houses provided for workers is needed. We need to control child labour in agriculture work(*Adana Chamber of Agriculture - CoA*).

4.3. DEVELOPING POLICY SUGGESTIONS FOR THE SOLUTION OF PROBLEMS IN THE LABOUR MARKET IN ADANA PROVINCE

Some of the ideas developed in the Workshop were:

4.3.1. Employment per Sectors in Adana

- Adana has an important presence in GDP. MoLSS wants to work with all the institutions improving the employment in the region
- Agricultural work is very hard and it was normal for workers not to work in exchange of a minimum wage. There were Syrians today but they would not be here tomorrow. Different solutions must be found, a wage premium must be paid by the companies to retain workers.
- Concerning the seasonal agriculture, Adana receives national funds. MoLSS allocated 270,000 EUR from international funds to bring the working conditions to a decent level.
- Under Labour Law, MoLSS determines joint policies together with employers and employees and carries out a structure for both. Some barriers were removed with the application of ILO’s 87 and 89 Conventions. MoLSS played its role in maintaining social dialogue to improve cooperation between business world and unions.
- Better employment policies need also the participation of Universities to improve education according to the needs of sector. MoLSS has initially provided high level centralised meetings between the industry and universities. This was a platform which led the way to open special departments with the advice of Consultation Councils, but there are difficulties with the reports and outcomes of the applied programmes.



This project is co-financed by the European Union and the Republic of Turkey

4.3.2. Education Related to Employment

- MoLSS is very involved in professional management education. The Ministry supports technical needs, but it is needed to raise education of the industries.
- MoLSS has developed studies related to local systems and education, which it will share with the stakeholders to see their feedback
- It is necessary to think about new forms of employment and the new skills which will be needed.
- It is important to consider the important role which the private sector plays, either unilaterally, or in partnership with governments and donors, in equipping workers with the skills required in the local markets.
- Contact with professional schools will be made. Certain branches on education will be identified for a future planning.
- The internships, trainings on entrepreneurship were some of the ways for achieving a qualified generation in the future. The Ministry has started a serious process to improve these studies and to carry out together with the stakeholders. Adana has always provided a different perspective in the fields of agriculture and industry.

4.3.3. Women's Employment:

- Gender (in) equity was seen as an issue for Turkey to address.
- Training and access to grant funding are beneficial to encourage the growth of women's entrepreneurship
- MoLSS is encouraging equality in jobs in Turkey and has a particular focus on women's employment.
- MoLSS is studying the barriers to women employment and care responsibilities. There are projects related to women, PwDs and young entrepreneurs in the National Youth Employment Strategy Document.
- MoLSS has been carrying out studies about women in the families of seasonal workers in agriculture to receive occupational training and also about their children receiving education.
- MoLSS has 15 incentives. Among them, there were employment incentive, women support, The Ministry of Culture incentive; and they are working on simplifying them.
- About women's entrepreneurship, there was an amendment in income tax law and a tax exemption that was introduced for homemade products above a certain amount to be sold online in international platforms (e.g. Hepsiburada). But there have been some problems in marketing and making production suitable for marketing. Though there is improvement in the production and designing of products in demand.

4.3.4. Regulations

- MoLSS is conducting field studies to help identify solutions that industries and sectors need now, but it is important to consider the responsibilities of all the institutions (professional areas, universities) to create a common response. Each organisation must create a mentality of change to support a better future for Adana.
- MoLSS will take stakeholder comments into account in reviewing the level of and rationale for the minimum wage.
- To employ qualified personnel in line with legislation, employers need to have employment insurance which many seem reluctant to buy.



This project is co-financed by the
European Union and the Republic of Turkey

- After the workshop, meetings were held with the officials of Adana Provincial Directorate of Labor and Employment Agency, Provincial Directorate of Social Security, Adana Governorate and Adana Chamber of Industry by the delegation headed by the General Manager of Labor Nurcan Önder. Within the scope of the meetings, ideas were exchanged with the Governor of Adana, Mr. Süleyman Elban, and the Chairman of the Adana Chamber of Industry, Mr. Zeki Kıvanç, about local labor market dynamics.

5. DESCRIPTION OF PROCESS

The primary purpose of the Workshop - very much a practical working workshop - was to enable MoLSS to engage with stakeholders and to receive a diagnosis on Adana employment. The workshop was a platform to exchange information between representatives of the MoLSS, public, private and other organisations on issues of common interest relating to economic and social policy in the region. The main goal was to promote consensus-building among the main stakeholders in the world of work. This was a very interactive and transparent process, MoLSS took the stakeholders opinions very seriously and offered some initial ideas for solutions.

6. CONCLUSION

The workshop was a diagnosis of general labour market issues in Adana, with a particular focus on the needs for young people and women's employment, and the relation between employment and education. It is also proved their genuine desire to engage with stakeholders from all sectors to arrive at a consensus view of how to move forward.

FoW TAT
January 2021

Attachments:
Annex 1: Participant List





This publication was produced with the financial support of the European Union and the Republic of Turkey. Its contents are the sole responsibility of the consortium led by WEglobal A.Ş. in consortium with WEglobal Italy, Archidata Srl, and Federation of Trentina Cooperatives (FTC) and do not necessarily reflect the views of the European Union and the Republic of Turkey.