



This project is co-financed by the
European Union and the Republic of Turkey

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE FOR PROMOTING DECENT FUTURE OF WORK APPROACH WITH A FOCUS ON GENDER EQUALITY

(TREESP1.3. FoW/P-01)

TÜRKIYE

**INTERVENTION 14: ESTABLISHMENT OF FUTURE OF WORK COMMISSION
REPORT OF THE 3rd MEETING OF THE FUTURE OF WORK COMMISSION
HELD ON 23 SEPTEMBER 2022
OCTOBER 2022**





This project is co-financed by the
European Union and the Republic of Turkey

Table of Contents

1. Introduction
2. Context
 - 2.1. Project ToR
 - 2.2. MoLSS Focus
3. Description of the event
 - 3.1. Venue
 - 3.2. Agenda of the 3rd. FoWC Meeting
 - 3.3. Participants
 - 3.4. Visibility
4. Content of the 3rd FoWC Meeting
 - 4.1. Presentation from the MoLSS
 - 4.2. Presentation from ILO - Emre Dönmez (Expert)
 - 4.3. Presentation from ETF - Romain Boitard & Ümmühan Bardak (Experts)
 - 4.4. Presentation from ERBD - Theresa Niederle (Expert)
 - 4.5. Presentation from MoLSS - Esra Sermin ATA (Labour Expert)
5. Participants' Evaluations on Green Jobs
6. Description of process
7. Conclusions
8. Annexes
 - 8.1. Desk Research Document on Green Jobs
 - 8.2. List of Participants
 - 8.3. Presentation from ILO - Emre Dönmez (Expert)
 - 8.4. Presentation from ETF - Romain Boitard & Ümmühan Bardak (Experts)
 - 8.5. Presentation from ERBD - Theresa Niederle (Expert)
 - 8.6. Presentation from MoLSS - Esra Sermin ATA (Labour Expert)



This project is co-financed by the European Union and the Republic of Turkey

1. INTRODUCTION

This Report provides a summary of the 3rd Meeting of the Future of Work Commission Meeting, held on 23 September 2022, under Intervention 14 (Establishment of Future of Work Commission).

2. CONTEXT

2.1 Project ToR

The Project's Terms of Reference (ToR) for Intervention 14 require the following:

“Future of Work Commission will be established to discuss new strategies and legislations in accordance with the Future of Work approach. The Commission will be gathering 5 times on a six-monthly basis during the implementation of the operation with the participation of stakeholders, social partners, academicians, professional vocational associations, representatives of the private sector, etc. 50 participants will attend each meeting and will last one day. 10 participants out of 50 will be outside of Ankara. After completion of each meeting, a detailed report will be prepared by the Contractor”.

2.2 MOLSS Focus

The Operation Beneficiary (OB) requested that the 3rd Meeting of the FoW Commission should focus on the “transition to a green economy”. A work document was prepared on this subject: “Green Jobs: a Gender perspective” (attached as Annex 1), which included, among other topics:

- Greening the Economy through ILO Posture;
- Green Growth;
- Jobs and Social Impacts in Europe
- Skills Needed for a Green Transition;
- Green Jobs for Women;
- Green Jobs in Türkiye;
- Potential and Impact;
- Some Preliminary Conclusions.

3. DESCRIPTION OF THE EVENT

3.1 Venue

The Workshop should be held as a physical event, in the Point Hotel Ankara. The OB selected the Hotel as it offered the space and facilities which were required for the event. The cost of arranging the event was an eligible item in the Project's Incidental Budget: the overall cost of the event was just over 5.570 EUR.



This project is co-financed by the European Union and the Republic of Turkey

3.2 Agenda

TAT and OB worked together on the agenda for the Workshop: the final version was as follows:

Time	Focus	Presenter
10.00-10.30	Registration and Coffee	
10.30-10:45	Introductory Remarks	Nurcan ÖNDER General Director General Directorate of Labour MoLSS
10:45-11:00	When is Green not Green? <i>(Insights into what are, and are not, green jobs within ILO definitions).</i>	Emre DÖNMEZ Expert ILO - Türkiye
11:00-11:30	“Shades of Green” <i>(The nuances of the green transition process and the impact on the ecosystem + a specific focus on ETF work on the green energy sector).</i>	Romain BOITARD Ümmühan Bardak Experts ETF (online)
11:30-11:45	“Unlocking the power of women for the green transition” <i>(The implications for women of the transition process).</i>	Theresa NIEDERLE Expert EBRD - Türkiye
11:45-12:00	“The Way of Transition to Green” (Just transition approach and the early studies in Türkiye)	Esra Sermin ATA Labour Expert MoLSS
12.00-14:00	Lunch	
14.00-16.00	Discussion	Moderated by Esra Sermin ATA Labour Expert MoLSS
16.00-16.15	Closing Remarks	

3.3 Participants



This project is co-financed by the European Union and the Republic of Turkey

TAT drafted an e-invitation to the event which was distributed by OB. **54** participants joined the workshop, representing different organizations and institutions, of which **44** were public sector, **1** was the private sector, and **9** were other institutions/organisations. **11** MoLSS staff were present and **6** persons from TAT. (See Annex 2 for the full list of participants).

Of the total of participants, **51** participants were from Ankara, **3** participants were from outside of Ankara, and **3** were online.

3.4 Visibility

The Project's visibility materials were displayed:

- A 'spider' was used as a backdrop for the registration table.
- 2 sets of banners (Turkish flag; HRDOS logo; MoLSS logo) were hung in the meeting area;
- Visibility kits were issued to all participants comprising: a bag; notepad; pen; factsheet; folder; USB stick; mug.

4. CONTENT OF 3rd MEETING OF THE FUTURE OF WORK COMMISSION (FoWC)

All presentations assessed the relationship between green economies and employment.

4.1 Presentation from the MoLSS

Nurcan ÖNDER, general director of General Directorate of Labour (MoLSS), noted that:

- There is a need for new employment strategies after the pandemic, under the umbrella of decent work. The main strategy includes the promotion of jobs and enterprises, guaranteeing rights at work, extending social protection, and promoting social dialogue as the four pillars of the ILO Decent Work Agenda, with gender as a cross-cutting theme. These are crucial to advancing the entire sustainable development agenda.
- Green jobs are part of this new agenda, and new perspectives and approaches are needed. The FoWC is a good space to discuss this.

4.2. Presentation from ILO - Emre Dönmez (Expert)

Under the title of "When is Green not Green?", the main points were:

- 1.2 billion jobs depend on a stable environment (40% of all jobs);
- 23 million jobs are lost each year due to man-made natural disasters;
- By 2030, 72 million jobs could be lost due to "heat stress";
- Overfishing could destroy 85.7 million jobs in the fishing industry;
- If the transformation is successful, 24 million new jobs will be created by 2030 in the energy, automotive, and construction sectors, while 6 million jobs will be lost (18 million net employment growth);
- 120 million jobs will be lost if sustainable farming practices (conservative, organic) can be adopted (Africa and Asia);
- The circular economy will create 6 million new jobs, and waste management will create 45 million new jobs, while mining will lose 60 million jobs, 50 million manufacturing;



This project is co-financed by the European Union and the Republic of Turkey

- The definition of green work is still unclear and that a job that looks "green" may not be green enough. A challenge for the near future.

4.3. Presentation from ETF - Romain Boitard & Ümmühan Bardak (Experts)

Under the title of “Shades of green”, the main points were:

- The United Nations defines green jobs as sectors and jobs in which waste creation and pollution are minimised. The International Labour Organisation (ILO) includes in its definition of green jobs any sector that has a lower-than-average environmental footprint. Statistical agencies across the world usually focus their definition of green jobs on the definition of the environmental goods and services sector. The distinction between jobs and skills is important because the labour market dynamics of “greening” in the economy are, and will be, complex into the future. Skills analysis offers a disaggregated level to examine and unpick these dynamics.
- Greening the economy will affect skills needs in three ways: Structural changes lead to increased demand for some occupations and decreases for others; New economic activity will create new occupations and there will be a need for new skills profiles and qualification and training frameworks, and many existing occupations and industries will experience greening changes to tasks within their jobs, and this will require adjustments to the current training and qualification frameworks for these occupations.
- Green skills include technical skills (related to occupations or sectors), transversal skills (cross-sectoral), and values and attitudes (as a pro-environmental attitude)
- On Employment in the Energy Sector: global employment in the energy sector: 58 M jobs in 2017, for 2050 there will be an increase of total jobs up to 100 M. Fastest growing green jobs: sustainability manager, wind turbine technician, solar consultant, ecologist, environmental health and safety specialist. The cases of Albania and Tunisia were presented.
- Main occupations needed in the energy sector: New jobs linked to renewable energy sources; New jobs linked to application/diffusion of ICT, digitalisation, and data processing; High-skilled occupations; emerged from data mining; ENGINEERS: Jobs involving electrical, mechanical, and construction technologies; TECHNICIANS AND OPERATORS: Supporting engineering activities above; ENERGY EFFICIENCY EXPERTS: Increasing job profiles across all economic sectors; ASSEMBLERS: Jobs both in traditional and renewable areas; TECHNICIANS: Jobs involving installation, maintenance & repair.
- **Conclusions on Green jobs: Most of the changes will happen in the existing jobs for greener tasks; Technology development and digitalisation linked to green goods and services; business consulting, project management, sales of green products services**
- **Conclusions on Green skills: Environmental awareness is part of 21st-century citizenship (green values); Both generic and technical green skills will be required by all jobs and No green restructuring is possible without having a critical mass of green skills.**

4.4. Presentation from ERBD - Theresa Niederle (Expert)

Under the title “Unlocking the power of women for the green transition”, the main points were:

- On Inequalities between men and women hinder climate change adaptation and mitigation efforts:
 - Gender-based barriers to entry in green sectors (Barriers to entry and retention in the energy and construction sector include skills gaps, perceptions of gender roles and a lack of flexible working conditions);
 - Gender gaps in agricultural innovation (Unequal land ownership/control and lower access to technology and skills);
 - Gender-blind urban planning (Lack of consideration of women’s perspectives and needs in the design of (green) transport, water/waste management, public spaces, etc.);



This project is co-financed by the European Union and the Republic of Turkey

- Gender-inadequate green finance mechanisms (The absence of a focus on gender equality in green financing instruments can exacerbate gender inequalities in the transition to the green economy).
- The EBRD promotes women's participation in the green transition through three channels:
 - Access to finance and entrepreneurship: (Embed gender equality considerations into green finance investments and green loan products; Support financial institutions to better target women entrepreneurs operating in green and agricultural sectors; Offer advisory services for female entrepreneurs on green transition topics);
 - Access to skills and employment: (Support employers in setting up gender-responsive vocational training, dual education models, mentoring, and career development initiatives; Increase women's participation in technical and managerial green jobs through more inclusive HR policies, incl. care solutions; Address legal barriers to women's employment in green sectors);
 - Access to services: (Ensure women's access to water and irrigation infrastructure, and green agricultural knowledge; Integrate the needs and perspectives of women (e.g. safety, security, accessibility, affordability) into green urban infrastructure development and Promote gender-responsive policies in climate-affected sectors).
- Finally, the Expert emphasized that supporting women in the green transition lay at the heart of 2 EBRD strategies: **Strategy for the Promotion of Gender Equality 2021-2025 (SPGE)** and **Equality of Opportunity Strategy 2021-2025 (EOS)**.

4.5. Presentation from MoLSS - Esra Sermin ATA (Labour Expert)

Under the title "The Transitions to Green" the main points were:

- A reflection on the European Green Pact: the EU's new strategy for growth and job creation;
- The climate change and the opportunities and risks for employees, employers, and the public sector;
- The challenges of the green transformation (decent work, Sustainable production (medium-long term profitability, market expansion, adaptability), Changing the composition of the factors determining international competitiveness, R&D and production motivation, Avoiding climate impacts and costs of carbon-based production (health costs, informal economy, and employment, income distribution...), etc.
- According to a Report from the World Bank, Türkiye is ranked 17th in terms of carbon emissions;
- Investment in green transformation was estimated at 165 billion USD;
- The Agenda of Fair Transition in Türkiye includes:
 - Strategy development studies;
 - Efforts to build a Just Transition Platform;
 - Multidimensional governance structures: at the national, sectoral, regional, and local level;
 - Efforts to create funding sources for Just Transition studies;
 - Skills development activities and acquisition of new skills for employment protection (re-education, vocational training, macro-planning of vocational guidance-intermediation activities);
 - Coordination of employment-oriented works for a just transition with local governments.
- The Green Pact Action Plan includes 32 goals and 81 actions, and MoLSS is part of the Green Consensus Working Group.



This project is co-financed by the European Union and the Republic of Turkey

5. PARTICIPANTS' EVALUATIONS ON TRANSITIONS TO A GREEN ECONOMY

The main issues discussed by stakeholders following the presentations were:

- **Green Jobs needs integrated policies** that involved different stakeholders (public sector, academics, NGOs) to manage the transformation.
- **Talent shortages.** The lack of qualified workers is impeding the growth of many green industries. There is a need to invest in training programs in order to bring on board green employees who can both do a good job and help keep a company's reputation clean and green. Related to this, important work on **Green Skills** needed must be done. There is a need to establish “vocational standards”. A skill needs analysis should be conducted at the government and institutional level, to establish skills required by men and women to equally participate and benefit from opportunities created in the green job sectors. This should be done in collaboration with employers and labour organizations. The information should be used to create targeted green skills development and training initiatives for men and women.
- **Green Jobs for women** represents a big opportunity.
 - The emerging green sector offers an opportunity to address the many pre-existing employment challenges faced by women in the non-green labour market. It is possible, especially given the unprecedented opportunity to educate and train a diverse set of workers, including women, to benefit from the developing green economy.
 - There are opportunities for women to advance from low-skill, entry-level positions to high-skill, higher-paying green jobs.
 - There are opportunities for women to train for jobs that are traditionally dominated by men.
 - Opportunities also exist for women to become green entrepreneurs by starting their own green businesses and becoming green employers rather than employees.
 - In one sense, the green economy offers a blank slate, and new opportunities to promote equality between women and men.
- **The Need for Government Regulation.** Underpinning -- and at times unlocking -- these challenges are the need for increased government policies, subsidies, and laws. Without these, it will be difficult for sectors like renewable energy to prosper. In many countries, currently, fossil fuels receive enormous subsidies, and many solar, wind and other technologies are still in their infancy and need local, state, and, above all, federal support to flourish.
- **Sectoral studies** are needed (IT, manufacturing, transport, construction sector) to understand which is the carbon footprint and which are the needs of each sector.
- An important reference to the **EUD policies** was made. The transition to a climate-neutral economy will trigger a fundamental transformation across a wide range of sectors. New jobs will be created, while some jobs will be replaced and others redefined.
- Main conclusions are that Turkiye needs to:
 - **promote and support green employment;**
 - **address the skilling and reskilling of workers;**
 - **anticipate changes in workplaces of the future;**
 - **Labour organisations, educational bodies, and public authorities should work together to improve the green transformation.**

6. DESCRIPTION OF PROCESS

The stakeholder's commitment and involvement in the Meeting were very obvious. After all the presentations, a genuine discussion took place and many useful contributions were made by stakeholders on all agenda items.



This project is co-financed by the
European Union and the Republic of Turkey

7. CONCLUSION

The 3rd Future of Work Commission Meeting showcased MoLSS's interest in the Green Economy, along with their focus on the decent future of work with gender equity. The lively discussion showed, too, that this was a topic of significant interest to stakeholders.

FoW TAT

October 2022





This publication was produced with the financial support of the European Union and the Republic of Türkiye. Its contents are the sole responsibility of the consortium led by WEglobal A.Ş. in consortium with WEglobal Italy, Archidata Srl, and Federation of Trentina Cooperatives (FTC) and do not necessarily reflect the views of the European Union and the Republic of Türkiye.